

SAG(09)6
Review of proposals submitted to IASRB

	<i>SAG(08)05 Changes in trophic levels of Atlantic salmon through the marine phase of their life cycle</i>	<i>SAG(08)06 Inferring temperature history of Atlantic salmon at sea based on oxygen isotope ratios in otoliths</i>	<i>SAG(08)07 Food availability of Atlantic salmon post-smolt during their marine phase</i>	<i>SAG(08)08 A study of the relationship between ocean climate and inter-annual variation in adult summer migration distribution patterns of Atlantic salmon in Irish coastal waters over three decades</i>
Evaluation criteria	ICR(03)14 is quite ambitious in the detailed information requested for proposals. None of the submitted proposals provide the detailed information described in this document and given the funding envelope available to the board, requesting such details at this stage is unwarranted.			
Relevance to SALSEA program	Relevant to SALSEA program objective	Relevant to SALSEA program objective	Relevant to SALSEA program objective	Peripherally relevant to SALSEA program objective in that it addresses distribution of 1SW maturing fish (much later stage of life cycle identified by SALSEA) at a very specific location.
Addresses broad question of salmon ecology at sea	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea, comparison of maturing and non-maturing stages, and status of survivors.	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea, comparison of maturing and non-maturing stages, and status of survivors.	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea particularly if information on prey in post-smolt stomachs is linked to potential prey from macro-plankton sampling. Value of acoustic data is in the multi-dimension coverage not possible with physical sampling gear.	Would provide information on mixing of river stocks at sea on the return migration near the coast. Greatest value relates to the temporal variation in stock distribution and its association with climatic factors.
Potential to be successful	Stable isotope technology is well described in literature. The only risk to the project is the extent of collections of post-smolts at sea. Update on progress shows few samples obtained in	Oxygen isotope technology to define temperature is well described in literature. The only risk to the project is the extent of collections of post-smolts at sea. Update on progress shows	Sample collection is not an issue. Sampling coverage is not extensive given the size of the area sampled and temporal coverage provided. Acoustic sampling would be	Indicated in proposal that genetic identification of river-specific stocks is well advanced.

	2008 and no samples from West Greenland in 2008.	few samples obtained in 2008 and no samples from West Greenland in 2008.	more complete if sounding is continuous. Is it possible to ground-truth acoustic data? Are there initiatives elsewhere that would allow interpretation of acoustic data? Not clear how much work is involved in analyzing acoustic data or which expertise would be called to guide the analysis.	
Scientific quality of participants	Not provided but personally know the main participants.	Not provided but personally know the main participants.	Not provided but personally know most of the main participants.	Not provided but personally know most of the main participants.
Details on costing	Costing is adequately described	Costing is adequately described	Costing is adequately described.	Costing is not adequately described
Extent of collaboration	Involves people from several national labs and one university.	Involves people from several national labs and one university.	Involves people from several national labs, no university.	Involves people from a national labs and several universities.
Contributions of partners	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples. A large amount of contributions not specifically identified in proposal.	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples but these are covered in sampling associated with projet SAG(08)05. A large amount of contributions not specifically identified in proposal.	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples and real expenses from SALSEA-Merge. A large amount of contributions not specifically identified in proposal.	Archived samples represent a large inkind contribution. A large amount of contributions not specifically identified in proposal resulting from work in SALSEA-Merge and elsewhere.
Suggestions for improving work	Would have benefited from a complementary analysis of trophic state of NEAC fish from post-smolt sampling, samples from West Greenland would include NAC and NEAC salmon.	Would have benefited from a complementary analysis of NEAC fish from post-smolt sampling, samples from West Greenland would include NAC and NEAC salmon and knowing that temperature environment used by post-	Are there other biological oceanographic data that could be used to more completely describe the environment in this area? Is there sampling of stomach contents from other species to address the question of	Could consider selecting scales / years to be processed based on observed important differences in environmental conditions (for ex. pick specific years of contrasting NOA indices or drought versus deluge freshwater

		smolts differs between NAC and NEAC.	competition for resources?	conditions) and test these for explanatory power.
Funding potential from IASRB	Partial funding for this proposal already approved by IASRB. Additional funding level not within the scope of support available from IASRB. Require a revised costing based on samples collected in 2008 and potential for collections in 2009 and 2010.	Funding request is within the scope of funding by IASRB. Requires a revised costing based on samples collected in 2008 and potential for collections in 2009 and 2010.	Funding request is outside the scope of funding by IASRB	Funding request is outside the scope of funding by IASRB