SAG(09)11
Summary of review of research proposals submitted to IASRB

	SAG(08)05 ***Changes in trophic levels of Atlantic salmon through the marine phase of their life cycle***	***SAG(08)06*** ***Inferring temperature history of Atlantic salmon at sea based on oxygen isotope ratios in otoliths***	***SAG(08)07*** ***Food availability of Atlantic salmon post-smolt during their marine phase***	***SAG(08)08*** ***A study of the relationship between ocean climate and inter-annual variation in adult summer migration distribution patterns of Atlantic salmon in Irish coastal waters over three decades***	***SAG(09)4*** ***Post-smolt survey in the Irminger Sea***	***Workshops to improve collaborations (support external people)***
Relevance to IASRB priorities	Relevant to IASRB priorities - enhancement of existing projects	Relevant to IASRB priorities - enhancement of existing projects	Relevant to IASRB priorities - enhancement of existing projects	Peripherally relevant to IASRB priorities in that it addresses distribution of 1SW maturing fish (rather than post-smolt) at a very specific location.	Relevant to IASRB priorities (Irminger Sea sampling)	Workshops by priority – 1) GIS support for WKLUSTRE 2) support for SGBICEPS 3) proposal for microchemistry standardization (scales and other tissues?) – is there an issue that needs to be resolved?
Addresses broad question of salmon ecology at sea	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea, comparison of maturing and non-maturing stages, and status of survivors.	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea, comparison of maturing and non-maturing stages, and status of survivors.	Expected to provide information on ecology of salmon at sea Value of acoustic data is in the multi-dimension coverage not possible with physical sampling gear.	Would provide information on mixing of river stocks at sea on the return migration near the coast. Greatest value relates to the temporal variation in stock distribution and its association with climatic factors.	Adds information of salmon distribution at sea in area which has not been well studied.	1) Analysis of historical tagging data using new technologies is providing new information on salmon distribution at sea 2) Study group is analyzing characteristics of

						salmon throughout North Atlantic
Potential to be successful	Stable isotope technology is well described in literature. The only risk to the project is the extent of collections of post-smolts at sea. Update on progress shows few samples obtained in 2008 and no samples from West Greenland in 2008. - may require a review of standardization of methods among labs	Oxygen isotope technology to define temperature is well described in literature. The only risk to the project is the extent of collections of post-smolts at sea. Update on progress shows few samples obtained in 2008 and no samples from West Greenland in 2008. - may require a review of standardization of methods among labs	Sample collection is not an issue. Plankton sampling coverage is not extensive given the size of the area sampled and temporal coverage provided but acoustic sampling would provide more complete coverage as sounding is continuous. Is it possible to ground-truth acoustic data? Are there initiatives elsewhere that would allow interpretation of acoustic data? Not clear how much work is involved in analyzing acoustic data or which expertise would be called to guide the analysis.	Indicated in proposal that genetic identification of river-specific stocks is well advanced.	NA	Constructive results from previous workshops and study group participation of outside experts.
Details on costing	Costing is adequately described	Costing is adequately described	Costing is adequately described.	Costing is not adequately described	Costing is not adequately described - funding for science person to go to sea and to pay for extra days at sea	Costing is approximate pending venue and number of experts

Cost of project	40,000 pounds ($79,000 Cdn)	22,500 pounds ($43,140 Cdn)	226,000 pounds (259,428 Euros)	131,000 pounds (150,000 Euros)	22,000 pounds (25,000 Euros)	1) GIS support for tagging workshop: 2,000 pounds 2) Study group on biological characteristics 4,000 pounds
Funding requested from IASRB (amount and % of)	20,000 pounds (50% of total) (approved in 2008)	22,500 pounds (100% of total)	226,000 pounds (100 % of total)	131,000 pounds (100 % of total)	22,000 pounds (XX% of total)	1) GIS support for tagging workshop: 2,000 pounds 2) Study group on biological characteristics 4,000 pounds
Number of years (single or multi-year)	Two (revised from three)	Two (revised from three)	Three	One	One ?	1) Third year of three(?) 2) One (?)
Extent of collaboration	Involves people from several national labs and one university.	Involves people from several national labs and one university.	Involves people from several national labs, no university.	Involves people from a national labs and several universities.	Survey involves several countries (Iceland, Germany, Russia)	Extensive
Contributions of partners	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples. A large amount of contributions not specifically included in proposal (marine vessels, WG sampling, freshwater monitoring).	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples but these are covered in sampling associated with projet SAG(08)05. A large amount of contribution not specifically included in proposal.	Large amount of inkind and resources associated with collection of samples and real expenses from SALSEA-Merge. A large amount of contributions not specifically included in proposal.	Archived samples represent a large inkind contribution. A large amount of contributions not specifically included in proposal resulting from work in SALSEA-Merge and elsewhere.	Vessel time provided from participating countries	National participants on internal funds
Suggestions for improving work	Would benefit from coordination / complementary analysis of trophic state of NEAC fish from smolt, post-smolt sampling, as samples from West	Would benefit from complementary analysis of NEAC fish from smolt, post-smolt sampling, as samples from West Greenland include NAC and	Provide details on other biological oceanographic data that could be used to more completely describe the environment in this	Could initially consider selecting scales / years to be processed based on observed important differences in environmental	Need details on use of funds	None

	Greenland include NAC and NEAC origin salmon.	NEAC origin salmon. Temperature environment used by post-smolts differs between NAC and NEAC?	area. Provide detail on sampling of stomach contents of other species.	conditions (for ex. pick specific years of contrasting NOA indices or drought versus deluge freshwater conditions) and test these for explanatory power.		
Funding potential from IASRB	Partial funding for this proposal already approved by IASRB. Additional funding level exceeds the current funding available from IASRB. Revised costing based on samples collected in 2008 and potential for collections in 2009 and 2010 provided.	Funding request exceeds the current funding available from IASRB. Requires a revised costing based on samples collected in 2008 and potential for collections in 2009 and 2010 (provided).	Funding request exceeds the current funding available from IASRB.	Funding request exceeds the current funding available from IASRB.	Funding request exceeds the current funding available from IASRB.	Funding request is within the scope of current funding by IASRB.
Recommendation	Support by IASRB	Support by IASRB	Support by IASRB	Important project proposal but is outside current IASRB priorities	SAG supports plan to sample in Irminger Sea but insufficient details of how funds will be used.	Support by IASRB